Soften the Pain, Increase the Gain: Enhancing Users’ Resilience to Negative Valence Feedback

Y. Wayne Wu, Brian P. Bailey
University of Illinois
Imagine you are designing a logo for your personal website...
Soccer Game Logo
Posted by u/NoahRiffe 1 day ago

Working on a personal logo. I'd love to get some feedback!
Posted by u/soaqajonking 2 days ago

Logo Critique
Posted by u/35ia3133 2 days ago

Design is my passion blink blink :) No seriously people can you give me some critique on this logo i did for practice.  redd.it/uczsee...
Posted by u/zelano 3 days ago

Sustainable Jewellery Brand with a Focussing on Marine Inspired Items
Posted by u/MBP13 3 days ago

Mailcat Logo a Self-project on my free time, feel free to c&c  redd.it/fo8q6...
Posted by u/hot_forme 4 days ago

Concept sketch for a band logo in working on it's for a blue grass band how can I improve on this?  imgur.com/@HKNU...
Posted by u/ulek_17 6 days ago

Update I was able to put this together last min open to suggestion  redd.it/h19pz8...
“The design is so bad that no one wants to critique it.”
Negative Feedback is Common Online

- Users with low-agreeable traits are more active online.
- People are more aggressive because of online disinhibition effect.
- Negative feedback snowballs.
Online feedback collection has many benefits.

- Low cost + Fast Response
- Seek feedback from a diverse audience
- Particularly useful for novice content generators
Three Theory-Based Coping Activities

- **Self-affirmation**: Critcher et al. ‘10; Sherman & Cohen ‘06; Steele ‘88

- **Expressive Writing**: Lazarus ‘93; Pennebaker ‘97; Duijnhouwer et al. ‘12

- **Distraction**: Baird et al. ‘12; Broderick ‘05; Rooij & Jones ‘13
Feedback Set of Different Valence Balances

- In reality, content creators usually receive a set of feedback.
- We would like to see how effective the interventions are.
- Four levels of valence balances: all negative, mainly negative, mainly neutral, all neutral.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Structure</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Negative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A stronger ending is in order. Perhaps the author can come up with more gripping and distinguished ending material.</td>
<td>The ending is terrible. Perhaps the author should at least come up with some less boring and plain ending material.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Style</td>
<td>The first error in my opinion is the use of personal pronouns. I was taught not to use “I” or “me” in essays because it makes the essay sound less professional.</td>
<td>One big obvious error here is the use of personal pronouns. The first thing I learned from Writing 101 is to avoid using “I” or “me” in essays. Only newest rookie uses personal pronouns.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content</td>
<td>I pretty much agree with all of the points you have made. I would add the argument of the protection of civil liberties.</td>
<td>I don't really buy any of the points you have made. I would add the argument of the protection of civil liberties to make this essay closer to being convincing, if that’s ever possible.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Research Questions

- How do feedback sets with different balances of valence affect participants’ affective states, extents of revision, and perceptions of the feedback and its providers?

- To what degree can coping activities based on theories of self-affirmation, expressive writing, and distraction, mitigate the influence of negative feedback on these same measures?
4 x 4 design with Coping Activity and Valence Balance
Writing Task

Task Instruction
Please write a short essay on the following topic:

Why would you support (or not) stricter gun control laws in the United States?

Your essay should be 100 words minimum and 250 words maximum. Essays that are too vague or plagiarized from other sources will be rejected. Note you may be invited to perform a HIT of similar length and payment in two days.

Check Word Count
Self-Affirmation

Core Values Questionnaire

Please rank the following six values in the order of personal importance (1 = most important). Then explain why the top ranked value is most important to you.

Values:
- Business
- Art, music, theater
- Social life, relationships
- Science, pursuit of knowledge
- Religion, morality
- Government, politics

Reset Ranking

1 -- -- --
2 -- -- --
3 -- -- --
4 -- -- --
5 -- -- --
6 -- -- --

Write why your top most important value is important to you:
Expressive Writing

Reflective Writing

In the following space we would like you to work on understanding your feelings regarding the feedback you received. Just take some time and feel free to experience and express your emotions in the text box. You can read the original feedback listed below.

The ending is terrible. Perhaps the author should at least come up with some less boring and plain ending material.

One big obvious error here is the use of personal pronouns. The first thing I learned from Writing 101 is to avoid using "I" or "me" in essays. Only newest rookie uses personal pronouns.

I don't really buy any of the points you have made. I would add the argument of the protection of civil liberties to make this essay closer to being convincing, if that’s ever possible.
Distraction

Article Summarization

Please read the following article and summarize the main arguments.

Energy

I think a lot about how important cheap, safe, and abundant energy is to our future. A lot of problems—economic, environmental, war, poverty, food and water availability, bad side effects of globalization, etc.—are deeply related to the energy problem.

I believe that if you could choose one single technological development to help the most people in the world, radically better energy generation is probably it. Throughout history, quality of life has gone up as the cost of energy has gone down.

[article abbreviated for compact presentation]

your summarization:
Reflective Writing

In the following space we would like you to work on understanding your feelings regarding the feedback you received. Just take some time and feel free to experience and express your emotions in the text box. You can read the original feedback listed below.

The ending is terrible. Perhaps the author should at least come up with some less boring and plain ending material.

One big obvious error here is the use of personal pronouns. The first thing I learned from Writing 101 is to avoid using "I" or "me" in essays. Only newest rookie uses personal pronouns.

I don’t really buy any of the points you have made. I would add the argument of the protection of civil liberties to make this essay closer to being convincing, if that’s ever possible.

Article Summarization

Please read the following article and summarize the main arguments.

Energy

I think a lot about how important cheap, safe, and abundant energy is to our future. A lot of problems—economic, environmental, war, poverty, food and water availability, bad side effects of globalization, etc.—are deeply related to the energy problem.

I believe that if you could choose one single technological development to help the most people in the world, radically better energy generation is probably it. Throughout history, quality of life has gone up as the cost of energy has gone down.

[A]rticle abbreviated for compact presentation]

Your summarization:
Reflective Writing

In the following space we would like you to work on understanding your feelings regarding the feedback you received. Just take some time and feel free to experience and express your emotions in the text box. You can read the original feedback listed below.

The ending is terrible. Perhaps the author should at least come up with some less boring and plain ending material.

One big obvious error here is the use of personal pronouns. The first thing I learned from Writing 101 is to avoid using "I" or "me" in essays. Only newest rookie uses personal pronouns.

I don't really buy any of the points you have made. I would add the argument of the protection of civil liberties to make this essay closer to being convincing, if that's ever possible.
Measures

- Affective states
- Revision extents
- Perception of the feedback and its providers
Affective States
Affective States

The diagram above illustrates the affective states across different conditions. The x-axis represents the conditions: Control, Self Affirm., Exp. Writing, and Distraction. The y-axis shows the level of happiness, with a range from 0 to 7. The data points show the average happiness levels across the conditions with error bars indicating the variability. The stars represent the highest levels of happiness.
Revision Extents
Revision Extents
Perception of Feedback Providers
Perception of Feedback
Discussion

- Affective states, revision extents, and perceptions have different levels of sensitivity to negative feedback.
- Nonliteral feedback may still carry negative valence.
- Platform designers could choose which activity to use based on which measure they value most.
Contributions to Theory

- The coping activities are not as generalizable as prior work shows.
- Mixed valence balance feedback set may be more nuanced than negative valence information.
- Participants may consider feedback to be subjective opinions instead of factual information.
Conclusion

- Empirical knowledge of how negative feedback sets impact users’ affective states, revision extents, and perception
- Deeper empirical understanding of how the coping activities mitigate the effects of negative feedback
- Practical guidelines regarding when to use what coping activity to improve users’ resilience to negative feedback
Limitations

- Participants recruited from MTurk
- Generic feedback instead of customized feedback
Future Work

- Larger feedback set
- Positive valence feedback
- Expert participants