NOVICES WHO FOCUSED OR EXPERTS WHO DIDN'T?
HOW EFFORT AND EXPERTISE CUES AFFECT
JUDGEMENT OF CROWD WORK

Y. Wayne Wu, Brian Bailey
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign
Using Online Crowds for Feedback Generation

▷ Empowerment
▷ Affordable
▷ Global Audience
Designed my Own Wedding Invitations, thoughts?
submitted 26 days ago by EamesGurl94

Together with their families

Viktorija Sxxxxxx
&
Feliks Cxxxxxxx

Invite you to their wedding

09.17.2016
Ceremony starts at 4:30PM
The XXXXXX Garden
4321 XXXXXXXX Ave

Cocktails | Dinner | Dancing

Reception starts at 7:00PM
The XX Ballroom
231 XXXX Ave
Detroit Michigan
Gorgeous. I'm a big fan of modern, simple wedding invitations.

idk where I am supposed to go. Everything is really hard to read.
Related Work

Credibility

Social Transparency
Huang & Fu 2013, Marlow & Dabbish 2015, Stuart et al. 2012
Research Questions

**RQ 1**
How do explicit cues of a provider’s effort and expertise affect the perceived quality of the feedback provided for a design?

**RQ 2**
How are the effects of these cues mediated by the intrinsic quality of the feedback?
The following screenshot shows the home page of a community college. Please offer some feedback for improving the design. Use the mouse cursor to annotate the area related to your feedback, and enter the feedback in the text box. You can modify the color of the annotation using the controls below. Feedback that is too short or vague may be rejected.

When you are ready, please select **Start Task** to reveal the screenshot.

Annotation

Text Feedback

There are too many menus on the page. The one on the left side could be removed. The photo in yellow is a bit boring.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IQ</th>
<th>Feedback Text</th>
<th>Annotation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The &quot;current students&quot; section could easily be placed under the &quot;student life&quot; section. That's where I always found it for the homage of my university. I would also place &quot;online learning&quot; under academics ... What is the difference between the two blue areas I circled? ... Register Now should be at the very top of the page. ...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Red - I don't see the relation in the quick links and having other &quot;quick&quot; links at the top. Yellow - Font could be larger to be more appealing. Blue - &quot;Important&quot; information seem bland; could be presented a little more interactive to increase circulation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Make the information bar and the top bars more visible. They are boring and need to be more interesting to the student. Also get rid of the sign up for Parkland news since that should put on a page for current students. Make your page more demanding for the prospective students.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>In ability to add campus events to an existing calendar, such as google calendar or iphone.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Styling is not good.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
9 Cue Manipulation Conditions

Effort: High, Low, None Given

Expertise: High, Low, None Given

HE/LX: High Effort, Low EXpertise
LE/NG: Low Effort, None Given

...
Please review the feedback provided for the community college page below. The feedback consists of annotations on the image and comments below the image.

Make the information bar and the top bars more visible. They are boring and need to be more interesting to the student. Also get rid of the sign up for parkland enews since that should put on a page for current students. make your page more demanding for the prospective students.

Task: It is known that the person who left the feedback invested significant effort to develop the feedback. It is also known that the person who left the feedback has little to no knowledge of design. From 1 (least useful) to 5 (most useful), rate the perceived usefulness of the feedback.

Rating: 4
Sugartrees 1 point 25 days ago

Gorgeous. I'm a big fan of modern, simple wedding invitations.

soundsgreatnoprob lem 3 points 25 days ago

idk where I am supposed to go. Everything is really hard to read.
Prior Work

Modeling Behavior of Crowd
Rzeszotarski & Kittur 2012
Cheng et al. 2015

Budget Control & Task Recommendation
Gao & Parameswaran 2014
Ambati et al. 2011
Effort Data Collection

PARKLAND COLLEGE

evite

TED Ideas worth spreading
Feature Sets

▷ Annotation
▷ Text entry
▷ Timings
Labeling Procedure

▷ Rating calibrated by sample
▷ Watch replay before rating
▷ Content masked with ‘xxx’s
Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actual Rating</th>
<th>Predicted Rating</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Accuracy: 65%

Accuracy: 92%
Use Cases

▷ Low effort task auto-rejection
▷ Bonus encouragement
▷ Poor task design indicator
Conclusion

▷ Explore how effort and expertise cues influence feedback perception
▷ Demonstrate the feasibility of effort modeling
▷ Contributes a general sets of tool for studying effort in online work